

Corrigenda 3 et addenda to *Dharmakīrti's Pramānaviniścaya. Chapters 1 and 2. Critically edited by Ernst Steinkellner. Beijing-Vienna 2007*
(2.1.2013)

by Ernst Steinkellner, Vienna

After publishing a first list of corrigenda online dated 16 January 2008,¹ and a second list in *WZKS* dated 15 July 2008,² the following third instalment replaces these earlier lists. There are two reasons for concluding my efforts on improving the edition of 2007 now. On one hand, Masamichi Sakai's preparation of the KWIC index comprising all three chapters of the *Pramānaviniścaya* is soon coming to an end, and on the other hand, Harunaga Isaacson has meanwhile published a review which is not only of major methodological importance in regard to the more general issues of critically editing and the, hopefully preliminary, specific problem of the manuscripts' being unavailable, but also contains a number of valuable additional corrections as well as a list of additional testimonia.³

The much desirable availability of digital images of the real *Pramānaviniścaya*-manuscripts or other manuscripts from the Tibetan Autonomous Region cannot in all probability be expected in the near future. Nonetheless, I hope to be able during my next visit to Beijing to convince the authorities to allow at least the images of the copies of the manuscripts used for the editions to be put on the website of the institute in Vienna (<http://ikga.oeaw.ac.at/Mat/...>).

Abbreviations and signs used in the following are: add. = addition, App. = Apparatus, col. = column, del. = delete, em. = emended, l. = line, n. = note, > = change to.

vii, n.1,3: For the > ^{1a} For the

vii, n.1, last line: Fukuka > Fukuoka

¹ http://ikga.oeaw.ac.at/Mat/steinkellner07_corrigena.pdf.

² *WZKS* 51 (2007-2008) 207-208.

³ Harunaga Isaacson, Of Critical Editions and Manuscript Reproductions: Remarks apropos of a Critical Edition of *Pramānaviniścaya* Chapters 1 and 2. *manuscript cultures, Newsletter* 2 (2009) 13-20.

viii,15: translated. > translated.^{1a}

xiii, n.5,10: Idendifications > Identifications

xx, n.1, add.: A possible solution for the meaning of the name dPal mgrin has been offered by Toru Tomabechi, namely that it is the translation of Śrīkaṇṭha, an epithet for Śiva whose crest-jewel is the moon. With *gañs can mkhas pa* taken as a genitive, we arrive at the meaning “the Śrīkaṇṭha among the snowland’s scholars.” This may be the kind of proud self-assessment known of Sa skya Paṇḍita.

xxvi,8f: *grḍhrānupāsmāhe* > *grḍhrān upāsmāhe*

xxxvii,16: establishment > establishment

xxxviii,23: *nānavayaḥ* > *nānanvayaḥ*

xxxix,4: (2. 60,4) > (2. 60,6)

xl,12: no > not

1, App.1,3: (VETTER: 30); > (VETTER: 30);

1, App.1,6: 532,14f > 532,14f; PST 1. 62,10f

1. App.2,2: vyaktas A > vyaktan A

1. App.2,4, del.: avadhīraṇeti C : avadhareṇeti A

2,11: yathāvidhaḥ > yathāvidhe

2, App.1,3: (VETTER: 32 n.2 > (VETTER: 32 n.2)

2. App.2,4f: yathāvidha<ḥ> em. : yathāvidha C : yathāvidhe AB > yathāvidhe AB : yathāvidha C

4,5: pramānam > pramāṇam

4,10: tadyathā dṛṣṭa° > tad yathādṛṣṭa°

4. App.1, 2 (for *pramāṇetara*° ... °*sadbhāvaḥ* k.2a-c) add: MṛV 149,7f

4, App.2,2: (śes pa'i gsal ba T) > (PST, śes pa'i gsal ba T, cf. TR)

7, App.1,4, ^{x-x}, add.: TĀV IV. 26,9f

7, App.2, n.7, add.: As suggested by Elliot Stern (e-mail of 21.4.2008), *tayā rahitam* may well be only a gloss in the Tibetan translation that has been imported from NB 1.6. It is neither attested by citations nor in the commentaries by Dharmottara or Jñānaśrī. If so,

this has consequences for the preliminary stemma that has been proposed (p. xxxix): the Sanskrit exemplar (τ) of the Tibetan translation will have to change its place to become a descendent of β .

8, App.2,1, del.: $\text{upa}^\circ \text{AC} : \text{apa}^\circ \text{B}$

8, App.2, add.: ^{11f} $\text{sambhavati AC} : \text{bhavati B}$

9, App.1, ^{k-k}, add.: NBhūṣ 182,84

9, App.2, add.: ⁹ $\text{avikalpakaṃ AC} : \text{avikalpaṃ B}$

10,7 $\text{vyāpārāt} > \text{vyāpārān}$

10, App.1, ^{o-o}, add.: NBhūṣ 183,10f

12,6: $\text{tathāsamanvā}^{\text{b}}\text{hāre} > \text{tathāsamanvahāre}$

14,3 $\text{apratibhāsamānābhijalpāpratibhāsamānā} > \text{apratibhāsamānābhijalpā}$
 pratibhāsamānā

15,1 $\text{upayannāpayamaś ca} > \text{upayann apayamaś ca}$

15, App.2,2: $\text{upayannāpayamaś ca} > \text{upayann apayamaś ca}$

15, App.2,2f, del.: $\text{upayannāpayamaś em.} : \text{upayannapayamaś ABC}$

19, App.1,6, ^{w-w} ...14,21f; add.: $\text{NPT 29,15f; ŚD 149,12f; ĪPVV II 159,6f;}$

20, App.1,1 (for *niṣpāditakriye ... atipatati* 20,3f) add.: ^{x'-x'} AAĀ 268,5f

21, App.1,1 (for *nainam ... virodhāt* 21,1f) add.: ^{i'-i'} $\text{ŚVT I 123,12f; ŚVT I 258,14f}$
(for k.21cd) add: ⁱ²⁻ⁱ² ŚVT I 258,16

21, App.1,3 (for k.22ab) add.: ^{k'-k'} $\text{AAĀ 349,7; MrV 69,9}$

23,9: $\text{°ābhivyākti°} > \text{°ābhivyakti°}$

24,6: $\text{°yamātmāparo°} > \text{°yamātmā paro°}$

25,2: $\text{sukhaṃ anatiśaye} > \text{sukham anatiśaye}$

25, App.1,2 (after "PST 1.55,7-9") add.: ; NPT 17,12f

26, App.1,1 (after "Only k.24") add.: ĪPVV I 175,21f;

27, App.1,3 (after "TĀV") add.: $\text{I 77,15f; TĀV VII 170,9f; TĀV X 115,14f;}$

28, App.1,1 (after "+ 29,3;") add.: AAĀ 270,3f;

- 28, App.1,3 add.: NK¹ 188,3f
- 29, App.1,1 (for *tan na ... sphuṭayati* 29,2) add.: ^{a'-a'} ĪPVV II 410,16
- 29, App.1,3 add.: ; AAĀ 342,30
- 30,5f: eveti karaṇa° > evetikaraṇa°
- 31,10: iti ayam > ity ayam
- 31, App.1,3 (for *na hi ... sādhanam* 31,3) add.: ^{q'-q'} Ci'e PST 1.66,4f
- 34, App.1,3: 338,11 > 338,11)
- 40, App.1,6 add.: ; AAĀ 316,10
- 41, App.1,3 (for *svayam ... upalabhata* 41,12f) add.: ^{n'-n'} Ci' ŚVṬ II 108,20
- 41, App.2,3: mi dmigs pa' > mi dmigs pa'i
- 42, App.1,1 (for *ekavyāpāre kramāyogāt* 42,1) add.: ^{n'-n'} Ci' ŚVṬ II 108,21
- 42, App.1,1 (for *saṃvedanam ... kasyacid* 42,3f) add.: ^{o'-o'} ĪPVV II 86,11f
- 43, App.1,1 (after "VETTER: 100);") add.: ĪPVV II 129,1
- 44,1: ā saṃsāram > āsaṃsāram
- 45,6: °cidadrṣṭam > °cid adrṣṭam
- 47,2: pratyakṣena > pratyakṣeṇa
- 50, App.1,1 (after "164f)" add.: ; cf.HBṬ 16, n.11 (marginal n. in Ms, letter D. Malvania 5.6.1969)
- 51, App.1,1: NĪPP > NPT
- 54,3: abrūvan > abruvan brūvan > bruvan
- 57, App.1,1 (for *kāryasyāpi ... pratyakṣavat* 57,11-13) add.: ^{u'-u'} Ce' PVSV 3,3-6
- 60,5: apratiṣedho > apratiṣedhaḥ |
- 60, App.1,1 (for *yāvān ... 'nupalabdheḥ* 60,2) add.: ^{e'-e'} NBhūṣ 288,21; 289,5; ĪPVV I 239,15f
- 63,8: karyotpatter > kāryotpatter

- 63,9: antyakṣaṇe 'pratibandhaḥ > antyakṣaṇo 'pratibandhaḥ
- 63,11: kāraṇā- > kāraṇā-
- 63, App.2,2f, del.: antyakṣaṇe 'prati° em. :
- 64, App.1,2 (for *nāsattāniścayo ... viprakarṣiṇo* 64,9) add.: ^{s'-s'} R 80,16f
- 65,6: tāṅśāstraṃ > tāñ śāstraṃ
- 65,9: vyavasātum > 'dhyavasātum
- 65, App.2,2, del.: vyavasātum em.:
- 65, App.2,3: 'dhyavasātum BC : dhyavaśāntam A
- 68,5: janayatīty > janayatīti
- 69, App.2,3f: svahetu{kr}kṛter A : svahetuprakṛter B (rañ gi ... yin pas T) > svahetuprakṛter BC (rañ gi ... yin pas T) : svahetu{kr}kṛter A
- 82, App.2,3: kṣaṇas'ātasthāyī A > kṣaṇamātrasthāyī A
- 83,5: apekṣate > apekṣyate
- 83, App.2,2, n.⁵ add.: apekṣyata em : apekṣata ABC
- 85,8: 'kāraṇāt > 'kāraṇāt
- 85, App.2,1, add.: ⁴gamyate AB : avagamyate C
- 85, App.2,2, n.⁸: tatkāryaḥ C (de'i bras bur T) : kāryaḥ AB > tatkāryaḥ A (de'i bras bur T) : kāryaḥ BC (PVSU)
- 85, App.2,3, n.⁹ (after ·) add.: asaty apy AB : apy asaty C
- 86,5: jāyet > jāyeta
- 86, App.1,^{f-f}, add.: AAĀ 350,13f;
- 91,3: kim anyayā | > kim anyayā '
- 94, App.1,1 (for *yady anupalabhamāno ... atiprasaṅgāt* 94,4-6) add.: ^{h'-h'} Ce' PVSU
12,8-10
- 104: SSTAR > STTAR

105, Sources, add.: AAĀ Abhisamayālaṅkāraloka (Haribhadra) – *Aṣṭasāhasrikā Prajñāpāramitā Haribhadraviracitayā Ālokākhyavyākhyayā sahitā*. Ed. P. L. Vaidya. (Buddhist Sanskrit Texts 4) Darbhanga 1960.

108, TS: Śāntarakṣita > Śāntarakṣita

110, NBhūṣ: Śrīmadācāra- > Śrīmadācārya-

114, PSV: PSV > PSV²
-554.² > -554.

116, SKV: Delih > Delhi

120, TESB: budhistische > buddhistische
Vandenoek > Vandenhoek

129, col.2, del.: apīṣṭo vavahārabhāk 2,21d

130, col.1, del.: -artho bhinna ekas tatas tataḥ 2.27b

131, col.2, del.: grāhyaṃ laukikaṃ yadi 2.43b

132, col.1: tatphalo 'tatphalaś ca- 2.27a > tatphalo 'tatphalaś cārtho 2.27a

132, col.2, add.: *tādātmyād arthasaṃvitteḥ 1.41c (cf. 37, App.2, n.⁷)

132, col.2, add.: tad grāhyaṃ laukikaṃ yadi 2.43b

133, col.2: na yuktibādhā yatrāsti tat 2.43a > na yuktibādhā yatrāsti 2.43a

135, col.2, add: bhinna ekas tatas tataḥ 2.27b

137, col.1: śabdapraṇṛtter astīti saḥ 2.21c > śabdapraṇṛtter astīti 2.21c

138, col.1, add.: so 'pīṣṭo vyavahārabhāk 2.21d

138, col.2, add.: *svasaṃvit phalam ucyate 1.41d (cf. 37, App.2, n.⁷)

138, col.2, add.: 'hetor anyānapekṣaṇāt 2.58b